Phase Space and Jet Definitions in SCET

Saba Zuberi University of Toronto

W. Cheung, M. Luke and SZ Phys. Rev. D80:114021,2009

 $e^+e^- \rightarrow jets$



 y_{cut}



$$f_2 \equiv \frac{\sigma^{2\,jet}}{\sigma^0} \sim 1 + \alpha_s \ln^2 y_{cut} + \alpha_s^2 \ln^4 y_{cut}$$

$$e^+e^- \rightarrow jets$$

$$f_2 \equiv \frac{\sigma^{2\,jet}}{\sigma^0} \sim 1 + \alpha_s \ln^2 y_{cut} + \alpha_s^2 \ln^4 y_{cut}$$
$$H \cdot J \otimes S$$

Consider the dijet rate $\sigma \left(e^+ e^- \rightarrow 2jets \right)$

Question: Can we resum the large logs arising from jet algorithm phase space cuts?

In order to begin to address this question we calculate the NLO result for several 'traditional' jet algorithms in SCET.

Consider the dijet rate $\sigma \left(e^+ e^- \rightarrow 2jets \right)$

Question: Can we resum the large logs arising from jet algorithm phase space cuts?

In order to begin to address this question we calculate the NLO result for several 'traditional' jet algorithms in SCET.

OUTLINE

Jet algorithms - cone and clustering

How to treat phase space constraints?

- Show approach with consistent power counting of PS constraints. Demonstrates relationship between cutoffs in EFT and phase space limits & how to treat jet algorithm parameters
- Consistency with non-trivial zero-bin subtraction logs of homogeneous scale in collinear sector, simplifies jet algorithm combinatorics
- Connection between IR safety of soft and collinear contributions & UV regulator.

The Algorithms

• **Cone algorithm:** Sterman-Weinberg (1977)



$$f_2^{\rm SW} = 1 + \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{\pi} \left(-4\ln 2\beta \ln \delta - 3\ln \delta - \frac{\pi^2}{3} + \frac{5}{2} \right)$$

(Bauer, Lee, Manohar, Wise, 2004)

(Trott, 2006)

(Joutennus, 2010)

The Algorithms

• Clustering algorithm: JADE, kT

Define discriminant y_{ij} and cut parameter y_{cut} (and recombination scheme) Combine particles with smallest $y_{ij} < y_{cut}$ to form pseudoparticle Repeat until all $y_{ij} > y_{cut}$



• exclusive algorithms for e+ e-

Status SCET:

- Fully differential jet cross sections independent of jet observables (Bauer, Hornig, Tackmann, 2009)
- Sufficiently inclusive
 - **DIS** (Manohar, 2004)
 - invariant mass distributions for top jets with hemisphere jet definition (Fleming, Hoang, Mantry, Stewart, 2007)
 - angularity distributions (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009)
 - jet shape distributions with nonhemisphere jet algorithms (Ellis, Hornig, Lee, Vermillion, Walsh, 2010)

Status SCET:

- Fully differential jet cross sections independent of jet observables (Bauer, Hornig, Tackmann, 2009)
- Sufficiently inclusive
 - DIS (Manohar, 2004)
 - invariant mass distributions for top jets with hemisphere jet definition (Fleming, Hoang, Mantry, Stewart, 2007)
 - angularity distributions (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009)
 - jet shape distributions with nonhemisphere jet algorithms (Ellis, Hornig, Lee, Vermillion, Walsh, 2010)

Status QCD (SW, JADE, k_T):

- JADE: Does not exponentiate, not known how to resum (Brown, Stirling, 1990)
- k_T: 2 jet fraction exponentiates (Brown, Stirling, 1992)
 Resummation of NLL (Catani, Dokshitzer, Olsson, Turnock, Webber, 1991)
- Sterman-Weinberg : Resum logs of energy and angle (Mukhi, Sterman, 1982)

Ingredients:

- Independent emission approximation to obtain matrix element square
- Phase space factorization in soft limit

$$\Theta(1, \cdots, n; y_{cut}) \simeq \prod_{i=1}^{n} \Theta(i; y_{cut})$$

Status SCET:

Status QCD (SW, JADE, k_T):

• Fully differential jet cross sections

• JADE: Does not exponentiate, not



- angularity distributions (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009)
- jet shape distributions with nonhemisphere jet algorithms (Ellis, Hornig, Lee, Vermillion, Walsh, 2010)

Ingredients:

- Independent emission approximation to obtain matrix element square
- Phase space factorization for observable in soft limit

$$\Theta(1, \cdot, n; y_{cut}) \simeq \prod_{i=1}^{n} \Theta(i; y_{cut})$$

Status SCET:

- Fully differential jet cross sections independent of jet observables (Bauer, Hornig, Tackmann, 2009)
- Sufficiently inclusive
 - DIS (Manohar, 2004)
 - invariant mass distributions for top jets with hemisphere jet definition (Fleming, Hoang, Mantry, Stewart, 2007)
 - angularity distributions (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009)
 - jet shape distributions with nonhemisphere jet algorithms (Ellis, Hornig, Lee, Vermillion, Walsh, 2010)

Status QCD (SW, JADE, k_T):

- JADE: Does not exponentiate, not known how to resum (Brown, Stirling, 1990)
- k_T: 2 jet fraction exponentiates (Brown, Stirling, 1992)
 Resummation of NLL (Catani, Dokshitzer, Olsson, Turnock, Webber, 1991)
- Sterman-Weinberg : Resum logs of energy and angle (Mukhi, Sterman, 1982)

More recently:

• Non-global observables - only sensitive to emissions in a restricted angular region of PS (Dasgupta, Salam, 2001)

 $\alpha_s^n \ln^n y_{cut}$ not resummed.

Phase Space

• At $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s)$ the jet algorithm separates the 2 and 3 jet region





Phase Space in SCET



Phase Space in SCET



How do we integrate over PS in SCET:

- Instead a PS integral which extends above the cutoff of the relevant mode is replaced by a UV divergence.
- Occurs naturally in SCET consistently multipole expand PS constraints





How do we integrate over PS in SCET:

- Instead a PS integral which extends above the cutoff of the relevant mode is replaced by a UV divergence.
- Occurs naturally in SCET consistently multipole expand PS constraints





• JADE dijet rate to
$$\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s)$$

 $O_2 = \bar{\xi}_n W_n \gamma^{\mu} W_n^{\dagger} \xi_n$
(Manohar, 2003) $Z_2 = 1 + \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \frac{3}{2\epsilon} + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{-Q^2} \right)$
 $C_2 = 1 + \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{1}{2} \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{-Q^2} - \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{-Q^2} - 4 + \frac{\pi^2}{12} \right)$
naive collinear $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \tilde{\sigma}_{JADE}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{3}{2\epsilon} + \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln j + \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} + 2 \ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \ln j - 3 \ln^2 j - \frac{\pi^2}{3} + \frac{7}{2} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} + \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} - \frac{\pi^2}{2} + \frac{7}{2} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{2} + \frac{7}{2} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{jQ^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$
 $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} - \ln^2 \frac{\mu^2}{j^2Q^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right)$

virtual vertex and wave function are scaleless and vanish • JADE dijet rate to $\mathcal{O}(lpha_s)$

$$f_2^{\text{JADE}} = \frac{|C_2|^2}{|Z_2|^2} \left(1 + \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \left(\sigma_{\text{JADE}}^n + \sigma_{\text{JADE}}^{\bar{n}} + \sigma_{\text{JADE}}^{\text{soft}} \right) \right)$$
$$= 1 + \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-2\ln^2 j - 3\ln j + \frac{\pi^2}{3} - 1 \right)$$

Zero-bin necessary to get logs of a single scale in collinear sector
 It is useful to look at divergences with off-shellness for q and \overline{q}

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Real Emission} \quad \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{\text{JADE}}^n &= \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{jQ^2} - \ln^2 \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + 2\ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} \right) + \dots \\ \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{\text{JADE}}^{\text{soft}} &= \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon} \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{jQ^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{jQ^2} \right) + \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} \right)^2 - 2 \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} \right) \ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \right) + \cdots \end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_{\text{JADE}}^R = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(2\ln\frac{p_1^2}{Q^2}\ln\frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} + \frac{3}{2}\ln\frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \frac{3}{2}\ln\frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} \right) + \dots$$

UV divergences from phase space cancel between the soft and collinear real emission

• JADE: Buyer Beware!

$$(Monohar, 2003) \quad O_{2} = \bar{\xi}_{n} W_{n} \gamma^{\mu} W_{\bar{n}}^{\dagger} \xi_{\bar{n}} \qquad Z_{2} = 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s} C_{F}}{2\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^{2}} + \frac{3}{2\epsilon} + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^{2}}{-Q^{2}} \right) \qquad \mathbf{Q}$$

$$\left[C_{2} = 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s} C_{F}}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{1}{2} \ln^{2} \frac{\mu^{2}}{-Q^{2}} - \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{\mu^{2}}{-Q^{2}} - 4 + \frac{\pi^{2}}{12} \right) \right]$$

$$\left[\frac{1}{\sigma_{0}} \sigma_{JADE}^{n} = \frac{\alpha_{s} C_{F}}{2\pi} \left(\frac{2}{\epsilon^{2}} + \frac{3}{2\epsilon} + \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^{2}}{jQ^{2}} + \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{\mu^{2}}{jQ^{2}} + \ln^{2} \frac{\mu^{2}}{jQ^{2}} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{2} + \frac{7}{2} \right) \right]$$

$$\left[\frac{1}{\sigma_{0}} \sigma_{JADE}^{soft} = \frac{\alpha_{s} C_{F}}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^{2}} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu^{2}}{j^{2}Q^{2}} - \ln^{2} \frac{\mu^{2}}{j^{2}Q^{2}} + \frac{\pi^{2}}{6} \right) \right]$$

$$\alpha_{s} : Z_{s} Z_{J} Z_{\bar{J}} = 2Z_{2}$$

Can not resum leading logs using RG for hard, jet and soft contributions. We know JADE has problematic correlations in soft gluon emission. Appropriate soft theory? Additional scales? Break down of factorization?



April 8th, 2010



Previous work: unrestricted soft

Bauer, Lee, Manohar, Wise, 2004 : $\beta \sim \delta \sim \lambda$ Trott, 2006 : $\beta \sim \delta^2 \sim \lambda^2$ $p_{soft} \sim \Lambda_{QCD}$

 $_{Q} \rightarrow p_{g}$

 $(1-2\beta)Q$

(a)

 $2\beta Q$



eroi

6

 $2\beta Q$

(b)

 k_g^-

 $2\beta Q$

(*c*)

→p___

 δ

• Sterman Weinberg dijet rate to $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s)$



$$\begin{array}{l} \text{naive} \\ \text{collinear} \quad \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \tilde{\sigma}_{\text{SW}}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon} \left(\frac{3}{2} + 2\ln 2\beta \right) + 3\ln \frac{\mu}{\delta Q} + 2\ln 2\beta \ln \frac{\mu^2}{2\beta \delta^2 Q^2} + \frac{13}{2} - \frac{2\pi^2}{3} \right) \\ \text{zero bin} \quad \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{\text{SW}}^{n0} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{1}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu}{2\beta \delta Q} - 2\ln^2 \frac{\mu}{2\beta \delta Q} + \frac{\pi^2}{12} \right) \\ \hline \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{\text{SW}}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \frac{3}{2\epsilon} + \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu}{\delta Q} + 3\ln \frac{\mu}{\delta Q} + 2\ln^2 \frac{\mu}{\delta Q} - \frac{3\pi^2}{4} + \frac{13}{2} \right) \\ \hline \frac{1}{\sigma_0} \sigma_{\text{SW}}^{\text{soft}} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{4}{\epsilon} \ln \delta - 4\ln^2 \delta + 8\ln \delta \ln \frac{\mu}{2\beta Q} - \frac{\pi^2}{3} \right) \end{array}$$

$$f_2^{\rm SW} = 1 + \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{\pi} \left(-4\ln 2\beta \ln \delta - 3\ln \delta - \frac{\pi^2}{3} + \frac{5}{2} \right)$$

virtual vertex and wave function are scaleless and vanish

April 8th, 2010

• Finally consider k_T: Soft and collinear sectors are not separately IR safe in dim-reg!



• Finally consider k_{T} : Soft and collinear sectors are not separately IR safe in dim-reg!



In this regularization scheme soft and collinear are not separately IR safe: Does factorization fail?



$$\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \left(\sigma_{k_\perp}^s + \sigma_V^s \right) = -\frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\ln^2 \frac{y_c Q^2}{\Lambda_f^2} + \frac{\pi^2}{6} \right) \qquad \text{Total soft contribution} \text{IR finite}$$

Factorization of rate in SCET in to separately IR safe soft and collinear contributions is UV regulator dependent.

IR regulator dependence (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009) (Chiu, Fuhrer, Kelley, Manohar, 2009)

 k_T may factorize.

In conclusion:

- Shown a consistent power counting of PS integrals in SCET
 - UV divergences cancel between soft and collinear sectors
 - Zerobin non-trivial, necessary to control logs in collinear sector, simplifies jet algorithm combinatorics
- Factorization of soft and collinear in to separately IR safe contributions is UV regulator dependent.
- Question: Can we resum <u>all</u> large logs arising from jet algorithm phase space cuts? Not yet.

Collinear sector under control, but can not resum all logs in soft sector: presence of additional scales? failure of factorization? non-global logs?

Backup Slides

JADE with off-shellness

Real Emission $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \tilde{\sigma}_{\text{JADE}}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} + \frac{2}{\epsilon} \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{iQ^2} - \ln \frac{\mu^2}{i^2Q^2} \right) - \ln^2 \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + 2\ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \frac{3}{2} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} \right) + \dots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_{\rm JADE}^{n0} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon}\ln\frac{\mu^2}{j^2 Q^2}\right) + \dots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_{\text{JADE}}^n = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(\frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{iQ^2} - \ln^2 \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + 2\ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \frac{3}{2}\ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2}\right) + \dots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_{\rm JADE}^{\rm soft} = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon} \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{jQ^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{jQ^2} \right) + \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} \right)^2 - 2 \left(\ln \frac{p_1^2}{Q^2} + \ln \frac{p_2^2}{Q^2} \right) \ln \frac{\mu^2}{Q^2} \right) + \cdots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_{\text{JADE}}^R = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(2\ln\frac{p_1^2}{O^2} \ln\frac{p_2^2}{O^2} + \frac{3}{2}\ln\frac{p_1^2}{O^2} + \frac{3}{2}\ln\frac{p_2^2}{O^2} \right) + \dots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0}\sigma_V^s = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{2}{\epsilon} \ln\left(-\frac{\mu^2 Q^2}{n^2 n^2} \right) - \ln^2\left(-\frac{\mu^2 Q^2}{n^2 n^2} \right) \right) \dots$ $\frac{1}{\sigma_0} \left(\sigma_{\text{JADE}}^s + \sigma_V^s \right) = \frac{\alpha_s C_F}{2\pi} \left(-\frac{2}{\epsilon^2} - \frac{4}{\epsilon} \ln \frac{\mu}{jQ} \right) + \dots \right|$

• Finally consider k_T : Does factorization fail?

Using the method introduced in (Hornig, Lee, Ovanesyan, 2009) we would conclude that the k_T soft contribution is IR divergent, as we found using dim-reg to regulate UV



However with a cut-off on k+ k-, the PS becomes:

